Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lic Opcing 104 105 123 Page 1 of 23

# Redacted - Privileged

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Mon, 18 Nov 2019 18:46:19 +0000

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up as not heard response since message on 11/12. Thank you, Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen Sent: Tuesday, November 5, 2019 6:47:41 PM

To: Edelman, Sari Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lac (Document) 279 6 THIAd 09/21/23 Page 2 of 23

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I am confirming receipt of the below as I was out of office and returned today. I previously did not receive a response from email dated 10/8 (see attached) so my understa that FGP group and will get back to you regarding next steps.

Thanks

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Friday, November 01, 2019 9:58 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

The harassment complaint was extensive detailed letter about treatment by manager using abusive and bullying behavior. While I spoke with Joshua Smirnow about the office space, I also was clear that the c There was clearly implicit bias in how I was "managed" and spoken to in a manner clearly not appropriate by Joe Antonik and David Kaplan. Joshua Smirnow apologized for how they handled the situation to m female and I will not tolerate this treatment in my place of work. I do expect this to be addressed. Presently I continue to feel uncomfortable in my place of work. I need to know moving forward issues will be ad will be addressed.

As for the issue of space, this is not HR issue. Karen Oberlander and Miriam Ruiz are working with me to establish plan moving forward.

Dr. Edelman

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 6:45 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case

Thank you.

Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM To: Edelman, Sari

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week whe

Thanks.

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

**Subject:** CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be invo

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Tue, 12 Nov 2019 21:53:29 +0000

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

I did not receive the 10/8 email reply some reason, not sure why, and only saw it when went into old reply chain. Please let me know. I was notified today that in two weeks my office will be given to another doc as of January. I informed Huntington now that given 11/21 as date, so need move all these patients in less than two weeks time. I feel this is retaliatory to my complaint. Such short notice is going impact patien

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, November 5, 2019 6:47:41 PM

To: Edelman, Sari Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I am confirming receipt of the below as I was out of office and returned today. I previously did not receive a response from email dated 10/8 (see attached) so my understa that FGP group and will get back to you regarding next steps.

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Friday, November 01, 2019 9:58 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

#### Case 1:21-cv-00502-L/C (D) **H**il**a**d 09/21/23 Page 3 of 23

The harassment complaint was extensive detailed letter about treatment by manager using abusive and bullying behavior. While I spoke with Joshua Smirnow about the office space, I also was clear that the c There was clearly implicit bias in how I was "managed" and spoken to in a manner clearly not appropriate by Joe Antonik and David Kaplan. Joshua Smirnow apologized for how they handled the situation to n female and I will not tolerate this treatment in my place of work. I do expect this to be addressed. Presently I continue to feel uncomfortable in my place of work. I need to know moving forward issues will be ad will be addressed.

As for the issue of space, this is not HR issue. Karen Oberlander and Miriam Ruiz are working with me to establish plan moving forward.

Dr. Edelman

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 6:45 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case.

Thank you.

Dr Edelman

From: Pacina. Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM

To: Edelman, Sari Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week whe

Thanks Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

**Subject:** CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be invo

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Fri. 1 Nov 2019 13:57:59 +0000 Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

Hi,

The harassment complaint was extensive detailed letter about treatment by manager using abusive and bullying behavior. While I spoke with Joshua Smirnow about the office space, I also was clear that the c There was clearly implicit bias in how I was "managed" and spoken to in a manner clearly not appropriate by Joe Antonik and David Kaplan. Joshua Smirnow apologized for how they handled the situation to n female and I will not tolerate this treatment in my place of work. I do expect this to be addressed. Presently I continue to feel uncomfortable in my place of work. I need to know moving forward issues will be ad will be addressed.

As for the issue of space, this is not HR issue. Karen Oberlander and Miriam Ruiz are working with me to establish plan moving forward

Dr. Edelman

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 6:45 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case

Thank you.

Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-L/C (Document) 279/6 THIAd 09/21/23 Page 4 of 23

To: Edelman, Sari

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

Kathleen

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are not at Marcus Avenue. Plea Thanks.

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: CASE 00282382

Н

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be invo

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 23 Oct 2019 22:45:03 +0000

Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case.

Thank you,

Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM

To: Edelman, Sari

**Subject:** RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week whe

Thanks

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be invo

Thank you

Sari Edelman

From: "Hall, Tisa (HR)" <Tisa.Hall@nyulangone.org>

To: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>, "Rose, Claudia" <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 3 Oct 2019 16:15:42 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Kathleen I spoke to Josh Swirnow, AVP this morning and he indicated he spoke to Dr. Edelman on Friday (David was not there) and explained the rationale of using her office one day a we the communication she received was not clear and the practice leadership team should have spoken to all the physicians on the changes first then went to each one that was affected. Sh her schedule and she would not have an office when she returned to the practice at Marcus and Josh assured her this was not the case and she was not singled out and this affects others about the matter. Josh apologize for the miscommunication she received.

Can you round back with her to see if she still wants to pursue her complaint since she has been told the rationale for using her office one day a week when she is not at Marcus Avenue.

Tisa

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:47 PM

**To:** Hall, Tisa (HR); Rose, Claudia **Subject:** FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Tisa,

Claudia sent you Dr. Edelman's previous email (attached). Wanted to advise you of the below as well. She is requesting that HR be part of this conversation.

I will respond to let her know that I am reviewing her email internally. Let me know your thoughts.

Thanks,

Kathleen

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lac (Document) 479 (THiled 09/21/23 Page 5 of 23

From: Edelman, Sari < Sari. Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conversa

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations)" < David. Kaplan 2@nyulangone.org>

To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

**Date:** Fri, 27 Sep 2019 16:54:11 +0000 **Subject:** RE: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

When you have a moment, would like to connect

Thank you

David

David Kaplan, MPA

Senior Director, FGP Ambulatory Operations

NYU Langone Health, Faculty Group Practice

One Park Avenue, 10th Floor, New York, NY 10016

Tel: (646) 754-4940 | Cell: Redacted david.kaplan2@nyumc.org



From: Pacina, Kathleen Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 2:40 PM To: Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations) Subject: FW: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

fyi

From: Rose, Claudia <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:48 AM
To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Sublect: Dr. Sari Eddnesn Contracts

Subject: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

Attached are Dr. Edelman's original and renewed contracts. The only mention of space is in the original and reads as follows:

**Space:** Space provided to you for your NYU La responsibilities is for performing services for the NYU I only. You may not use such space for purposes of any of approved in writing by the Dean of the School of Medicin

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:02 AM
To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Thank you!

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 9:58 AM
To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM
To: Rose, Claudia <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Subject: Re: Dr, Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9.

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lac (Document) 279 6 THi Ad 09/21/23 Page 6 of 23

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM
To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Hi Claudia

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, NY 10016 T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 19:38:54 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Yes, I'm at ext. 5x2116.

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:38 PM

To: Rose, Claudia

**Subject:** RE: CASE 00282382 Are you available for a call?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:10 PM

**To:** Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Kathleen,

Thank you. Let me know if you'd like me to review the response too.

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:00 PM

To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

**Subject:** FW: CASE 00282382

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lic Oochmen 2796 THIAd 09/21/23 Page 7 of 23

Hi Claudia,

Sending this to you for review. Let me know if we should discuss.

Thanks.

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> Sent: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 9:01 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

**Subject: CASE 00282382** 

Good evening,

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, and wanted to clear

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raised with HR, and has

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any opinion I may have or professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space they are demanding is based on my "part tin time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceeded to refer to me a patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropriate time frame and team to discuss a matter conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opinions and decision making. This is my utmost concern, I need to I

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and David have agreed t present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice, which is the stated reason I will be "pushed" today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these years where I feel my growth as a physician is being deliberately infringe

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr. Edelman

From: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 19:10:10 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Kathleen,

Thank you. Let me know if you'd like me to review the response too.

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:00 PM

To: Rose, Claudia

**Subject:** FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Claudia,

Sending this to you for review. Let me know if we should discuss.

Thanks.

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> Sent: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 9:01 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: CASE 00282382

Good evening,

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, and wanted to clear

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raised with HR, and has

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any opinion I may have or professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space they are demanding is based on my "part tin time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceeded to refer to me a patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropriate time frame and team to discuss a matte conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opinions and decision making. This is my utmost concern, I need to I

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and David have agreed t present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice, which is the stated reason I will be "pushed" today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these years where I feel my growth as a physician is being deliberately infringe

I appreciate a prompt response

Dr. Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 18:54:47 +0000

Subject: CASE 00282382

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-Lac (Document) 279/6 THIAd 09/21/23 Page 8 of 23

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be invo

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina. Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 01:01:17 +0000

Subject: CASE 00282382

Good evening,

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, a

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raise

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any op fact with no regard for my professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space t acknowledge part-time employment when I was indeed full time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceed this time and returned to patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without proportion was distracted and remained upset about the conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opini

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and so would likely not be in my present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice physicians to help build FGP to this incredible place it is today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr Edelman

From: "Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations)" < David. Kaplan 2@nyulangone.org>

To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org> Cc: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 18:07:59 +0000

Subject: RE: Dr. Edelman

Just left you a VM. Please feel free to give me a call on my cell Redacted

Thanks David

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 1:26 PM To: Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations)

Cc: Rose. Claudia Subject: Dr. Edelman

Do you have a few minutes today to discuss an issue that was raised by Dr. Edelman regarding Joe Antonik?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858 F 646-754-9541

athleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> To: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 14:47:37 +0000
Subject: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

Attached are Dr. Edelman's original and renewed contracts. The only mention of space is in the original and reads as follows:

**Space:** Space provided to you for your NYU La responsibilities is for performing services for the NYU I only. You may not use such space for purposes of any of approved in writing by the Dean of the School of Medicin

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:02 AM

To: Rose, Claudia Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Thank you

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 9:58 AM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #.

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM
To: Rose, Claudia <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org> Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached a Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Hi Claudia,

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (O) N | Dept 22 | 09/21/23 Page 10 of 23

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

### Edelman, Sari eff 19141201 OL.pdf

### Edelman, Sari eff 19180101 RWL.pdf

From: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 13:58:13 +0000

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

### Hi Kathleen,

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #

#### Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM

To: Rose, Claudia Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9.

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM
To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Hi Claudia

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y, Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Rose, Claudia" <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC ON Page 11 of 23

**Date:** Tue, 17 Sep 2019 22:41:44 +0000

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks.

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia Rose@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM
To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen Ratina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Hi Claudia

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Rose, Claudia" <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Tue, 17 Sep 2019 22:09:04 +0000

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelmar

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Hi Claudia,

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (D) NIPPENT 3/29 (6) TF 1/20 109/21/23 Page 12 of 23

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Ogbara, Rashidat" <Rashidat.Ogbara@nyulangone.org>

Date: Mon, 18 Nov 2019 22:31:31 +0000

Subject: FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Rashidat,

As discussed, please see below and attached in reference to Dr. Edelman.

Thanks

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 4:53 PM

**To:** Pacina, Kathleen **Subject:** Re: CASE 00282382

I did not receive the 10/8 email reply some reason, not sure why, and only saw it when went into old reply chain. Please let me know. I was notified today that in two weeks my office will be given to another doc as of January. I informed Huntington now that given 11/21 as date, so need move all these patients in less than two weeks time. I feel this is retaliatory to my complaint. Such short notice is going impact patien

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, November 5, 2019 6:47:41 PM

To: Edelman, Sari

**Subject:** RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I am confirming receipt of the below as I was out of office and returned today. I previously did not receive a response from email dated 10/8 (see attached) so my understanding was that back to you regarding next steps.

Thanks.

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari < Sari. Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Friday, November 01, 2019 9:58 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

**Subject:** Re: CASE 00282382

Hi,

The harassment complaint was extensive detailed letter about treatment by manager using abusive and bullying behavior. While I spoke with Joshua Smirnow about the office space, I also was clear that the complaint was separ bias in how I was "managed" and spoken to in a manner clearly not appropriate by Joe Antonik and David Kaplan. Joshua Smirnow apologized for how they handled the situation to me directly in the phone conversation, as he w work. I do expect this to be addressed. Presently I continue to feel uncomfortable in my place of work. I need to know moving forward issues will be addressed in a professional environment without bias in order to continue pra

As for the issue of space, this is not HR issue. Karen Oberlander and Miriam Ruiz are working with me to establish plan moving forward.

Dr. Edelman

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 6:45 PM

**To:** Pacina, Kathleen **Subject:** Re: CASE 00282382

H

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case.

Thank you,

Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen

Sent: Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM

To: Edelman, Sari

**Subject:** RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are not

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conversa

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC OPNIPE(T) 129 (6) TF | (4) | 09/21/23 Page 13 of 23

Thanks, Kathleen

ari Edelman	OOM IDENTIAL
To: Date:	"Pacina, Kathleen" <kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org> "Edelman, Sari" <sari.edelman@nyulangone.org> Tue, 8 Oct 2019 14:55:42 +0000 RE: CASE 00282382</sari.edelman@nyulangone.org></kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org>
Hi Dr. Edelr	nan,
wanted to	follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are no
Thanks,	
Kathleen	
<b>Sent:</b> Thurs <b>To:</b> Pacina,	man, Sari <sari.edelman@nyulangone.org> day, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM Kathleen <kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org> ISE 00282382</kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org></sari.edelman@nyulangone.org>
łi	
wanted to fo	ollow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conve
hank you,	
ari Edelman	
To: Date:	"Hall, Tisa (HR)" <tisa.hall@nyulangone.org> "Pacina, Kathleen" <kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org>, "Rose, Claudia" <claudia.rose@nyulangone.org> Thu, 3 Oct 2019 16:15:42 +0000 RE: CASE 00282382</claudia.rose@nyulangone.org></kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org></tisa.hall@nyulangone.org>
he commu ner schedu	spoke to Josh Swirnow, AVP this morning and he indicated he spoke to Dr. Edelman on Friday (David was not there) and explained the rationale of using her office one day a winication she received was not clear and the practice leadership team should have spoken to all the physicians on the changes first then went to each one that was affected. So le and she would not have an office when she returned to the practice at Marcus and Josh assured her this was not the case and she was not singled out and this affects other nation. Josh apologize for the miscommunication she received.
Can you ro	und back with her to see if she still wants to pursue her complaint since she has been told the rationale for using her office one day a week when she is not at Marcus Avenue
- Tisa	
<b>ent:</b> Thurs <b>o:</b> Hall, Tis	na, Kathleen <kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org> day, September 26, 2019 3:47 PM da (HR) <tisa.hall@nyulangone.org>; Rose, Claudia <claudia.rose@nyulangone.org> V: CASE 00282382</claudia.rose@nyulangone.org></tisa.hall@nyulangone.org></kathleen.pacina@nyulangone.org>
Hi Tisa,	
Claudia ser	at you Dr. Edelman's previous email (attached). Wanted to advise you of the below as well. She is requesting that HR be part of this conversation.
will respo	nd to let her know that I am reviewing her email internally. Let me know your thoughts.

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this convers

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

**Date:** Tue, 5 Nov 2019 23:47:41 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

### Hi Dr. Edelman,

I am confirming receipt of the below as I was out of office and returned today. I previously did not receive a response from email dated 10/8 (see attached) so my understanding was that back to you regarding next steps.

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Friday, November 01, 2019 9:58 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

Hi.

The harassment complaint was extensive detailed letter about treatment by manager using abusive and bullying behavior. While I spoke with Joshua Smirnow about the office space, I also was clear that the complaint was separ bias in how I was "managed" and spoken to in a manner clearly not appropriate by Joe Antonik and David Kaplan. Joshua Smirnow apologized for how they handled the situation to me directly in the phone conversation, as he w work. I do expect this to be addressed. Presently I continue to feel uncomfortable in my place of work. I need to know moving forward issues will be addressed in a professional environment without bias in order to continue pra

As for the issue of space, this is not HR issue. Karen Oberlander and Miriam Ruiz are working with me to establish plan moving forward.

Dr. Edelman

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 6:45 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: Re: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on CASE 00282382, complaint requesting investigation for workplace harassment. I have not heard any response from HR since October 8.

If I am sending these inquiries to incorrect person please let me know. I believe you are the HR contact person for this case.

Thank you,

Dr. Edelman

From: Pacina, Kathleen

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 8, 2019 10:55:43 AM

To: Edelman, Sari Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are not

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conversa

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (O) N | Page 15 of 23

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

Date: Tue, 8 Oct 2019 14:55:42 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are not

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM
To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Hi

Subject: CASE 00282382

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this convers

Thank you.

Sari Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

**Date:** Tue, 8 Oct 2019 14:55:43 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I wanted to follow up with you regarding our last conversation. I understand that you met with Mr. Swirnow and he explained the rationale for office use one day week when you are not

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conversa

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>

**Date:** Thu, 26 Sep 2019 19:55:48 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Dr. Edelman,

I'm confirming receipt of your email and am reviewing internally with FGP HR. I will get back to you.

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 9:01 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: CASE 00282382

Good evening,

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, and wanted to clear

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJCONIPPTOR | TEMPO | 109/21/23 Page 16 of 23

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raised with HR, and has

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any opinion I may have or professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space they are demanding is based on my "part tin time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceeded to refer to me a patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropriate time frame and team to discuss a mattee conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opinions and decision making. This is my utmost concern, I need to I

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and David have agreed t present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice, which is the stated reason I will be "pushed" today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these years where I feel my growth as a physician is being deliberately infringe

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr. Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

To: "Hall, Tisa (HR)" <Tisa.Hall@nyulangone.org>, "Rose, Claudia" <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 19:47:07 +0000

Subject: FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Tisa,

Claudia sent you Dr. Edelman's previous email (attached). Wanted to advise you of the below as well. She is requesting that HR be part of this conversation.

I will respond to let her know that I am reviewing her email internally. Let me know your thoughts.

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 2:55 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: CASE 00282382

Hi

I wanted to follow up on email sent yesterday evening. Josh Smirnow and David Kaplan have requested phone conference call tomorrow at 1 pm. I would appreciate if you or an HR representative can be involved in this conversa

Thank you,

Sari Edelman

From: "Edelman, Sari" <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>
To: "Pacina. Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 01:01:17 +0000

Subject: CASE 00282382

Good evening,

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, ε

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raise

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any op fact with no regard for my professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space acknowledge part-time employment when I was indeed full time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he procee this time and returned to patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropria was distracted and remained upset about the conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opir

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and so would likely not be in my present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practic physicians to help build FGP to this incredible place it is today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all the

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr. Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 19:38:08 +0000

Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC ON Page 17 of 23

From: Rose, Claudia

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:10 PM

To: Pacina, Kathleen Subject: RE: CASE 00282382

Hi Kathleen,

Thank you. Let me know if you'd like me to review the response too.

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

Sent: Thursday, September 26, 2019 3:00 PM
To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>

Subject: FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Claudia,

Sending this to you for review. Let me know if we should discuss.

Thanks,

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari <Sari.Edelman@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 9:01 PM
To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Good evening

Subject: CASE 00282382

I am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, and wanted to clear

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raised with HR, and has

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any opinion I may have or professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space they are demanding is based on my "part tin time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceeded to refer to me a patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropriate time frame and team to discuss a matte conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opinions and decision making. This is my utmost concern, I need to I

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and David have agreed t present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice, which is the stated reason I will be "pushed" today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these years where I feel my growth as a physician is being deliberately infringe

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr. Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
To: "Rose, Claudia" <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Thu, 26 Sep 2019 18:59:35 +0000

Subject: FW: CASE 00282382

Hi Claudia,

Sending this to you for review. Let me know if we should discuss.

Thanks.

Kathleen

From: Edelman, Sari

Sent: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 9:01 PM

**To:** Pacina, Kathleen **Subject:** CASE 00282382

Good evening,

l am following up on our discussion from last week. Tonight our office manager David Kaplan requested to speak with me, and he apologized for Joe Antonik's behavior stating it was not appropriate request, and wanted to clear

This was matter of inappropriate conduct in the workplace in mannerism with which I was treated, and I am not sure this discussion now with Joe's senior manager was even appropriate as the issue was raised with HR, and has

In addition, he again raised request I was not in agreement with, and when stated such he said he would bring it to senior management of Joshua Smirnow, which again was done in manner to threaten any opinion I may have or professional opinion or contractual concerns. I consider this form of bullying in the workplace. I offered alternate solution to terminate my hours in Huntington since the shared space they are demanding is based on my "part tin time I consider an agreement of breech of my entire contract and am unwilling to risk my professional career and growth with NYU.

On completing my discussion with Joe he took on similar mannerisms of condescending tone, raising his voice to child like manner to placate my disagreement with his request. When I stated such, he proceeded to refer to me a patient care hours which I had been requested to halt for this unscheduled meeting. Again, an attempt to corner me in conversation to pressure me without allowing for more appropriate time frame and team to discuss a matte conversation, and had difficulty concentrating on patient care. It took me some time to refocus in the examination room to ensure I was providing appropriate opinions and decision making. This is my utmost concern, I need to t

As of female physician in the organization, I am disappointed that is 2019, approaching 2020 in a major hospital organization in New York, and I still have to contend with male chauvinism. While both Joe and David have agreed t present office space. It remains unclear to my why I am being discriminated against to accommodate another physician, particularly a male physician who will be joining the practice, which is the stated reason I will be "pushed" today. I have worked with amazing men and women over the years, whom all have supported the my growth and practice. This is the first time in all these years where I feel my growth as a physician is being deliberately infringe

I appreciate a prompt response.

Dr. Edelman

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org>

To: "Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations)" < David.Kaplan2@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 18:40:25 +0000
Subject: FW: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

fyi

From: Rose, Claudia

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:48 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

Attached are Dr. Edelman's original and renewed contracts. The only mention of space is in the original and reads as follows:

**Space:** Space provided to you for your NYU La responsibilities is for performing services for the NYU I only. You may not use such space for purposes of any of approved in writing by the Dean of the School of Medicin

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:02 AM To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org >

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Thank you!

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 9:58 AM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #.

Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM
Sose, Claudia <Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org>
Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Casjooti (to. 5). Can Each

I'll call you tomorrow at 9.

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Hi Claudia.

### Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (D) N Page 19 of 23

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

### Edelman, Sari eff 19141201 OL.pdf

#### Edelman, Sari eff 19180101 RWL.pdf

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

To: "Kaplan, David (FGP-Ambulatory Operations)" < David.Kaplan2@nyulangone.org>

Cc: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 17:26:14 +0000

Subject: Dr. Edelman

Hi David

Do you have a few minutes today to discuss an issue that was raised by Dr. Edelman regarding Joe Antonik?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

### Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 14:53:22 +0000 Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

Thanks Claudia.

From: Rose, Claudia

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:48 AM

To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Dr. Sari Edelman Contracts

Attached are Dr. Edelman's original and renewed contracts. The only mention of space is in the original and reads as follows:

Space provided to you for your NYU La responsibilities is for performing services for the NYU I only. You may not use such space for purposes of any or approved in writing by the Dean of the School of Medicin

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 10:02 AM
To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Thank you!

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (D) Nipper 1279 (17) TF 120 109/21/23 Page 20 of 23

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 9:58 AM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #

#### Claudia

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org > Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9.

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached a Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Hi Claudia,

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org> To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose @nyulangone.org

Date: Wed, 18 Sep 2019 14:02:08 +0000

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

### Thank you!

From: Rose, Claudia

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2019 9:58 AM To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

I sent an invite for 1:00 p.m. for you to call us on Joe's office phone at 516-467-8719. He already escalated to David Kaplan since the doctor asked Enid Papa for ELR's #.

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (D) Nipper 1279 (17) TF 120 109/21/23 Page 21 of 23

From: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 7:33 PM To: Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9. Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Tue, 17 Sep 2019 23:33:10 +0000

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

I'll call you tomorrow at 9.

Thanks and have a good night.

Kathleen

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:41 PM, Rose, Claudia < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Okay. Anytime starting at 9. I can reached at Redacted

Thanks

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 6:12 PM, Pacina, Kathleen < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org > wrote:

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC (D) Nipper 1279 (17) TF 120 109/21/23 Page 22 of 23

From: Rose, Claudia < Claudia.Rose@nyulangone.org> Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org>

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen.

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org> To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org>

Date: Tue. 17 Sep 2019 22:12:52 +0000

Subject: RE: Dr. Sari Edelman

Ok, wanted to discuss with you before bringing it to leadership as it is about Joe Antanik.

What time tomorrow works for you?

From: Rose, Claudia

Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2019 6:09 PM To: Pacina, Kathleen

Subject: Re: Dr. Sari Edelman

Hi Kathleen,

Yes. Of course. But faculty issues will need to be escalated to leadership.

Talk with you tomorrow. I can be reached at Redacted

Claudia

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 17, 2019, at 5:27 PM, Pacina, Kathleen <Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org> wrote:

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks.

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations

Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4th Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org

From: "Pacina, Kathleen" < Kathleen. Pacina@nyulangone.org >

To: "Rose, Claudia" < Claudia. Rose@nyulangone.org> Date: Tue, 17 Sep 2019 21:27:49 +0000

Subject: Dr. Sari Edelman

# Case 1:21-cv-00502-LJC ON Page 23 of 23

Hi Claudia,

Do you have a moment to discuss a matter raised by Dr. Edelman tomorrow?

Thanks,

Kathleen

### Kathleen Y. Pacina

Manager, Employee & Labor Relations Human Resources

NYU Langone Health

One Park Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, NY 10016

T 212-404-3858

F 646-754-9541

Kathleen.Pacina@nyulangone.org